

COMMITTEE REPORT

Team: Central Area
Date: 1 August 2006

Ward: Micklegate
Parish: Micklegate Planning Panel

Reference: 06/01345/LBC
Application at: Shepherd Homes Ltd 89 The Mount York YO24 1BL
For: Internal and external alterations including erection of a part one part two storey pitched roof extension; demolition of northeast wing (no.89A) and part of the Coach House and erection of two storey pitched roof building in the grounds; all in connection with use as a hotel.
By: Stephen Rodwell
Application Type: Listed Building Consent
Target Date: 10 August 2006

1.0 PROPOSAL

1.1 The introductory comments in relation to application ref: 06/01341/FULM also apply to this parallel application for listed building consent. The application has been appropriately advertised.

2.0 POLICY CONTEXT

2.1 Development Plan Allocation:

Listed Buildings Grade 2; 89 The Mount, York

City Boundary York City Boundary 0001

Schools Multiple (Spatial)

Conservation Area Central Historic Core 0038

Areas of Archaeological Interest City Centre Area 0006

DC Area Teams Central Area 0002

2.2 Policies:

CYHE4
Listed Buildings

3.0 CONSULTATIONS

3.1 INTERNAL

CONSERVATION ARCHITECT - see comments on 06/01341/FULM

CONSERVATION AREA ADVISORY PANEL - see comments on 06/01341/FUL

3.2 EXTERNAL

MICKLEGATE PLANNING PANEL - No objections

ENGLISH HERITAGE - We welcome the changes made to the scheme, and we do not wish to offer any comments on this occasion. The application should be determined in accordance with national and local policy guidance, and on the basis of your specialist conservation advice.

THE GEORGIAN GROUP - 89 The Mount is an early nineteenth-century stuccoed villa apparently constructed in several builds. It still possesses a number of internal and external historic features of note, including the fine staircase, fireplaces, plasterwork, shutters, sash windows and other joinery. It's local and architectural significance has been recognised in its Grade II listing. The Mount is commonly considered to be one of the finest nineteenth century areas of York.

The Group still have concerns about the large scale of the proposed extension, and total expansion envisaged for the building, although it is acknowledged that efforts have been made to address previous concerns about this. We wish to stress that the façade of the historic building should remain the most prominent architectural element of the property as it faces the mount

We welcome the removal from the scheme of the linked walkway at first floor level which we previously offered objections to. We maintain that it is common practice in fine hotels to have accommodation located away from the main block, with no walkway in between (See Middlethorpe Hall, York).

The other detail of the scheme which was of concern to the Georgian Group, was the timber framing of the veranda on the proposed north east extension, which was thought to be entirely at odds with the simple early nineteenth-century character of the building, and indeed the proposed extension. We welcome its removal from the scheme.

In summary, The Georgian Group maintain their concerns about the scale of the proposed enlargement of 89 The Mount, although we do not wish to offer any objections. We welcome the removal of certain unsatisfactory elements from the previously submitted scheme.

4.0 APPRAISAL

4.1 Key Issues

- impact on the special architectural and historic interest of the building.

4.2 Central Government advice in relation to listed building control is contained within Planning Policy Guidance Note 15: "Planning and the Historic Environment" (PPG15). It states in paragraph 3.3 that whilst the listing of a building should not be seen as a bar to all future change, the starting point for the exercise of listed building control is the statutory requirement on local planning authorities to "have special regard to the desirability of preserving the building or its setting or any features of special architectural or historic interest which it possesses" (Section 16 of the "Planning (Listed Buildings and Conservation Areas) Act 1990"). This reflects the great importance to society of protecting listed buildings from unnecessary demolition and from unsuitable and insensitive alteration and should be the prime consideration for authorities in determining an application for consent.

4.3 PPG15 recognises that generally the best way of securing the upkeep of historic buildings and areas is to keep them in active use (para 3.8), and that many listed buildings can sustain some degree of sensitive alteration or extension to accommodate new or

continuing uses (para 3.13). Paragraph 3.15 states that achieving a proper balance between the special interest of a listed building and proposals for alterations and extensions is demanding and should always be based on specialist expertise, and often demands a flexible and imaginative approach by all the parties involved.

4.4 The importance of listed buildings is reflected in Policy E4 of the Approved North Yorkshire Structure Plan, which states that buildings and areas of special townscape, architectural or historic interest (e.g. listed buildings) will be afforded the strictest protection. Policy HE4 of the City of York Draft Local Plan relates specifically to listed buildings and states that consent for development in the immediate vicinity of listed buildings, demolition, internal and external alteration, and changes of use will only be granted where there is no adverse effect on the character, appearance or setting of the building.

4.5 As stated in the report relating to the application for planning permission, the demolition of a single storey extension of relatively modern origins on the rear elevation of the principle building, and which forms part of the proposal, was approved as part of the previous planning permission granted in February 2005, and does not fall to be considered. The majority of the comments made in relation to application ref 06/01341/FULM are considered to be relevant to this parallel application for listed building consent. The new block on the corner of The Mount and Scarcroft Road, although it would affect the setting of the listed building, would not be physically linked to the principal building and thus does not form part of this application.

4.6 The proposal involves the carrying out of a number of internal alterations in order to provide functional links between various parts of the accommodation. The Conservation Architect is satisfied that the submitted scheme addresses the concerns that were expressed previously in this respect. The bridge link between the principal building and the new block, which formed part of the previous (withdrawn) application, has been omitted from the scheme. Members will note that the Conservation Area Advisory Panel have no objections to this revised scheme and indeed commend the architect on meeting previous concerns. English Heritage have not commented specifically on the proposal, stating that the application should be determined in accordance with national and local policy guidance, and on the basis of the Council's own specialist conservation advice. Whilst the Georgian Group have concerns in relation to the overall scale of the proposed enlargement of the property, they do not wish to offer any objections. They welcome the removal of certain unsatisfactory elements from the previously submitted scheme. In terms of the scale of the proposal, the proposed new build extensions are considered to be within the parameters set by the previous applications for planning permission and listed building consent, and are thus considered to be satisfactory.

5.0 CONCLUSION

5.1 In listed building terms, the proposal is considered to be satisfactory subject to the conditions recommended by the Conservation Architect, in order to ensure that the special architectural and historic character of the building is protected.

COMMITTEE TO VISIT

6.0 RECOMMENDATION: Approve

- 1 TIMEL2 Development start within 3 yrs (LBC/CAC)
- 2 The development hereby permitted shall be carried out only in accordance with the following plans:-

Drawing number PL07 Rev "A" - Proposed basement floor plans
Drawing number PL08 Rev "A" - Proposed ground floor plan
Drawing number PL09 Rev "A" - Proposed first floor plan
Drawing number PL10 Rev "A" - Proposed second floor plan
Drawing number PL11 Rev "A" - Proposed roof plan
Drawing number PL12 Rev "B" - Proposed front and rear elevations
Drawing number PL13 Rev "C" - Section elevation through courtyard
Drawing number PL14 Rev "B" - Proposed south elevation and sectional elevation
Drawing number PL15 Rev "A" - Proposed site plan at ground floor level
Drawing number PL16 Rev "B" - Proposed elevations (west and north) and north sectional elevation through courtyard
Drawing number 1356/1 - Existing trees on site

or any plans or details subsequently agreed in writing by the Local Planning Authority as amendment to the approved plans.

Reason: For the avoidance of doubt and to ensure that the development is carried out only as approved by the Local Planning Authority.

- 3 VISQ8 Samples of exterior materials to be app
- 4 VISQ7 Sample panel ext materials to be approv
- 5 Large scale details of the items listed below shall be submitted to and approved in writing by the local planning authority prior to the commencement of the development and the works shall be carried out in accordance with the approved details.

New ground floor opening to create bar lounge
Replacement fire screen at head of staircase
New first floor window on rear (east) elevation of main building
Adaptations to coach house walls including typical abutment details, copings and details of the new window/door and its reveals
Typical windows and window surrounds to new blocks, including dormer windows
Doors and door surrounds to new blocks
Courtyard canopy including sections at fixing positions onto existing structures
Cycle shelter
Sections through external walls of new blocks showing plinth, string courses and eaves details

Reason: So that the Local Planning Authority may be satisfied with these details.

- 6 VISQ10 Details of External services to be app
- 7 Prior to the commencement of the development a door schedule shall be submitted to and approved in writing by the local planning authority showing details of existing, new and relocated doors. Any measures for upgrading fire resistance shall be included within the schedule. The development shall be carried out in complete accordance with the approved details.

Reason: In order to protect the historic character of the building.

- 8 All existing fireplaces shall be retained in situ and any measures for their alteration or repair shall be agreed in writing with the local planning authority prior to the commencement of the development.

Reason: In order to protect the historic character of the building.

- 9 Details of any necessary measures to reduce sound transmission or improve fire resistance shall be submitted to and agreed in writing by the local planning authority prior to the commencement of the development, and the development shall be carried out in complete accordance with the approved details.

Reason: In order to protect the historic character of the building.

- 10 Prior to the commencement of the development, detailed plans shall be submitted to the local planning authority showing the location of all retained fixtures and fittings including fireplaces, decorative plasterwork and coving, shutters, cupboards and historic doors and doorcases. The development shall be carried out in complete accordance with any details that may be agreed.

Reason: In order to prevent the inadvertent removal of such fixtures and fittings, in order to protect the historic character of the building.

- 11 Prior to the commencement of the development, details of the new screen wall and canopy link between the main building and the coach house shall be submitted to and approved in writing by the local planning authority. The development shall be carried out in complete accordance with the approved details.

Reason: So that the local planning authority may be satisfied with these details.

7.0 INFORMATIVES:

Notes to Applicant

1. REASON FOR APPROVAL

In the opinion of the Local Planning Authority the proposal, subject to the conditions listed above, would not cause undue harm to interests of acknowledged importance, with particular reference to the effect on the special architectural and historic importance of the listed building. As such the proposal complies with Policy E4 of the North Yorkshire County Structure Plan (Alteration No.3 Adopted 1995) and Policy HE4 of the City of York Local Plan Deposit Draft.

Contact details:

Author: Simon Glazier Development Control Officer

Tel No: 01904 551351